

Art Out of Place? Toilets and Tribal Folk Art in Jharkhand

Radhika Borde¹ and Josef Novotný²

Abstract

This paper critically examines a strategy that the government of the state of Jharkhand in India is using to encourage toilet usage in rural areas – namely, the painting and decoration of toilets that were constructed with the help of government funds. This ‘toilet art’ that is being encouraged, often makes use of elements of the traditional tribal mural traditions of Jharkhand, and in some cases these traditions have been actively promoted for the purpose of decorating toilets as well as for sanitation-related messaging on walls more generally. The strategy is situated within the context of the Swachh Bharat Mission, which is a pan-India sanitation campaign and which so far has been largely aimed at constructing toilets in rural areas and encouraging their use. Along with examining this strategy, the paper offers suggestions for how it could be made more effective and relevant.

Keywords: sanitation, Santal, tribal art

Introduction

It stands to reason that publicly funded sanitation schemes aimed at providing toilets to India’s rural poor should also try and create a sense of ownership and pride vis-a-vis these toilets amongst beneficiaries. The strategies adopted in this regard, range from calling a toilet an ‘Izzat Ghar’³, literally ‘dignity house’, and employing local artists to paint these toilets in a style of folk art that is recognizably regional⁴. Such strategies would be referred to as belonging to the ‘software’ component of sanitation change schemes (Peal, Evans, and Van Der Voorden, 2010), and it is argued that this component, also known as the social context of WASH (Water, Sanitation and Hygiene), is more important than sanitation infrastructure development (Setty et al., 2019). This

¹ Dr. Radhika Borde (radhika.borde@gmail.com) is a researcher at the Department of Social Geography and Regional Development at the Charles University in Prague. She is currently participating in a project investigating sanitation and waste management in India, that is funded by the Czech Science Foundation and has published on social movements against mining in India, indigenous culture and religiosity, sacred natural sites, activist media and Adivasi women’s movements and the Anthropocene.

² Dr. Josef Novotný (josef.novotny@natur.cuni.cz) is an associate professor in the Department of Social Geography and Regional Development, Faculty of Science, Charles University. He is a distinctly interdisciplinary researcher with interests spanning the areas of environmental, economic and population geography, development studies and international development, migration studies, regional development, or applied spatial data analysis.

³ <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/call-swachh-bharat-toilets-izzat-ghar-centre-to-states/articleshow/61123473.cms>

⁴ <https://sbmgramin.wordpress.com/2019/01/30/over-54000-toilets-painted-in-ranchi/>

paper explores the use of tribal folk art as a form of sanitation change ‘software’. It describes how it was instrumentalized in the context of the implementation of a major sanitation scheme in the state of Jharkhand in India, and goes on to situate its use in the context of the general instrumentalization of cultural resources to initiate sanitation change. Finally, the paper explores what the implications of such endeavours could be, and the possible ways of improving their efficacy and cultural relevance.

The Swachh Bharat Mission in Jharkhand

The Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM), which is the sanitation scheme that this paper explores a few dimensions of, is a massive, pan-India sanitation change scheme (Mehta, 2018). The first phase of the SBM lasted from 2014 to 2019. It was presented as a flagship initiative of the newly elected government in 2014, and mentions of it found a prominent place in for example the speech of the Indian Prime Minister on India’s Independence Day in 2014. Officially launched on the birth anniversary of Mahatma Gandhi on the 2nd of October 2014, the aim of the SBM was claimed to be the fulfilment of Mahatma Gandhi’s dream of a clean India. It has been argued that by these claims the current Indian government has “appropriated Gandhi’s nationalist, anticolonial, emancipatory rhetoric for its own brand of governmentality” (Meskell, 2020: 15). In order to achieve the goal it set for itself i.e. that of a clean India, the SBM assigned itself the task of constructing toilets for each rural household lacking one, at a cost of Rs. 12,000. Making the country ‘Open Defecation Free’ (ODF) was seen as a first step towards achieving the goal of a clean India. 60% of the cost of these government-constructed toilets was to be borne by the centre and 40% by the state. Additional costs related to administration and IEC (information, education and communication) activities were also covered by a separate fund, limited to 8% of the total expenditure for the SBM (3% to be spent at the central level and 5% at the state level) – with similar cost sharing arrangements between centre and state as for toilet construction (Guidelines for SBM-G, 2017).

In relation to the goal of providing toilets to rural households across the country, the SBM has been described as a success. Jharkhand too has contributed to this success story –according to official SBM statistics pertaining to rural Jharkhand, from a toilet coverage of 14.17% as reported in 2014-2015, the state now has a cumulative toilet coverage of 100%⁵. However, it can be argued that these figures include cases of over-reporting, as there was a significant discrepancy between the toilet coverage statistics published by the Indian National Statistical Organization following a survey that showed how access to toilets had increased from 2012 to 2018, and those claimed by the implementers of the SBM for a comparable time period⁶. More importantly, across India, rates of toilet usage have been shown to be below those of toilet ownership, indicating that initiating and sustaining toilet adoption is a key issue that the government should focus on (Gupta et al., 2019). Also, previous sanitation campaigns in India are argued to have failed for the reason that they underemphasized the importance of sustaining toilet usage and focused more on just providing access to toilets (Hueso and Bell, 2013). It can

⁵ <https://sbm.gov.in/sbmdashboard/IHHL.aspx>

⁶ <https://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/rural-water-and-sanitation/only-71-3-rural-households-have-access-to-toilets-shows-nso-data-67929#:~:text=The%20new%20data%20shows%20that,rural%20areas%20regularly%20use%20toilets.>

be noted, that it is widely understood, that in India, cultural norms pertaining to ideas of purity and pollution derived from the Hindu caste system have influenced a lack of interest in toilet usage even when access is available (Juran, Adams and Prajapati, 2019; Vyas and Spears, 2018). However, other factors influencing a reluctance to use toilets, or facilitating toilet usage, may also be operational in India. A study conducted a few years earlier in Jharkhand found that interest in toilet adoption was lowest amongst the state's tribal population (the demographic and cultural significance of which is significant) which had not undergone religious conversion and which followed 'Sarna' (Novotný et al., 2018). Sarna is a term that is increasingly in use in East-Central India to refer to versions of the Animistic faith traditions of tribal communities, and which is distinct from Hinduism (Borde, 2019). The state government seems to be aware of a cultural disconnect between toilet adoption and tribal way of life. Senior government officers charged with SBM implementation argue that encouraging toilet usage is easiest amongst communities where a high cultural value is placed on the 'honour of women' and an emphasis on women's privacy, shielding them from the male gaze outside the home, etc. (Interview with Ranchi-based bureaucrat responsible for SBM implementation, October 2019). Since such cultural valuations are argued to be relatively absent in tribal communities in India (see Kumar, 1993; De, 2018), the need for other ways of making toilets culturally meaningful to tribal communities have been explored by SBM implementers in the state. SBM implementers in Jharkhand argue that an important innovation that the state has contributed to the SBM, is the practice of painting murals onto the walls of toilets – this paper discusses what this has involved, how it relates to tribal culture, and what it signifies.

Methodology

Most of the primary data presented in this paper was gathered via fieldwork conducted in the latter half of 2019, in the Kanke and Angara blocks of Ranchi district in Jharkhand, in the context of a larger research project studying sanitation change. The interviews and focus group discussions (FGDs) in rural areas were largely conducted by the primary author. Observation was also conducted in the villages of 12 Panchayats. Interviews were conducted with Mukhiyas (village headpersons), traditional healers and herbalists, Jal Sahiyas (government-appointed, village-level WASH volunteers), Swasth Sahiyas (government appointed, village-level health volunteers), Anganwadi Sevikas (village-level childcare centre workers) and the health workers at a Primary Health Centre (PHC) and hospital in Angara block. A household survey was also run in these 12 Panchayats. Several interviews and a few FGDs were done with the implementers of the SBM in Ranchi district and in Jharkhand as a whole. To mention a few of these: interviews were conducted with two experts responsible for SBM implementation in one half of Ranchi district – one specializing in the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of the program implementation process, and the other specializing in the information, education and communication (IEC) activities that were conducted as part of the program. An interview was also conducted with the secretary of the Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation in Jharkhand i.e. with the senior-most bureaucrat heading the nodal agency responsible for SBM implementation in the state. Follow-up interviews were also done over the phone in 2020, a few of these with an informant in Hazaribagh district of Jharkhand.

Mural Traditions of Jharkhand



Mural for the Sohrai festival made by a female artist on the mud wall of a house in Hazaribagh district, Jharkhand. Photo Credits: Radhika Borde

In rural Jharkhand it is not uncommon to see painted mud houses belonging to several of the state's tribes (Rani and Sharma, 2019). Traditionally, these would be created by the women of the household. Many of these paintings would have been made in the context of seasonal-religious festivals, and the motifs have cultural significance. Well-known art forms in this regard are those known as Khovar and Sohrai. Khovar for instance is argued to have prehistoric origins insofar as rock art on a cave in Jharkhand, known by local tribal groups as the Khovar Gufa (translated as Khovar cave) has been dated to the Meso-Chalcolithic (Imam, 2011). Sohrai art, which is associated with a harvest festival in Autumn, is painted on walls using sticks that are chewed to create toothbrushes. The colours (red, yellow, black, and white) are created by the artists with the help of coloured earths and ground stones. The Khovar art form consists of a technique of applying white or yellow earth onto a black base that is previously applied onto the walls. Before the white or yellow earth can dry, a comb is used to scratch out motifs. Khovar art is said to be associated with a spring festival. It is important to note that tribal wall art traditions are strongly linked with concepts of ritual purification (Rycroft, 1996), and the houses that are decorated are also cleaned prior to this. There are also tribal traditions of painting murals onto walls that are not linked to festivals. Members of the Santals paint the walls of their houses as soon as these are built. In addition to the earth colours that are used in Sohrai art, the Santals also make use of other colours, such as a blue derived from indigo mixed with clay. In relation to Santal wall art forms, often horizontal bands of colours are applied onto walls and geometric patterns are also created (Bharat, 2015).

Wall Art on Toilets in Jharkhand



A woman painting a mural in the Sohrai art style onto the mud wall of her house.
Photo Credits: Radhika Borde

The tribal wall art traditions of Jharkhand are being increasingly championed by the state. The Sohrai and Khovar art tradition has recently been given a Geographical Indication tag by the Geographical Indications registry in India⁷. The implementers of the SBM in Jharkhand have also not lagged behind in championing these art forms. State encouraged, and sometimes state-sponsored wall art on toilets is commonly seen in Jharkhand. In some cases, professional artists are hired to paint the walls of toilets and other structures in villages and in other cases incentives for painting murals on toilets are offered to the beneficiaries of the SBM toilet construction scheme. The SBM M&E expert responsible for SBM implementation in one half of Ranchi district, mentioned in an interview, that a toilet painting competition was organized on the occasion of World Toilet Day in November 2018 (the competition got underway some weeks after this occasion) – it was called the Swachh Sundar Shauchalaya Contest, literally the ‘Clean Beautiful Toilet Contest’. Those who had received toilets under the SBM were given paints and other materials to be able to participate in the competition, via funds earmarked for IEC activities under the SBM, and awards were given for the toilet judged to be the best painted (Interview with SBM M&E expert, November 2019). This was a pan-India contest and it is reported that 10 million toilets constructed under the SBM were painted across India⁸. The state of Jharkhand apparently won this pan-India contest – five of its districts were judged to be among the top ten in the country for reasons of the beautiful wall art that beneficiaries of the SBM toilet construction scheme had

⁷ <https://www.thehindu.com/entertainment/art/gi-tag-for-jharkhands-sohrai-khovar-painting-telanganas-telia-rumal/article31569123.ece>

⁸ <https://www.ndtv.com/photos/news/myizzatghar-one-crore-toilets-decorated-in-rural-india-as-part-of-swachh-sundar-shauchalaya-contest-97062#photo-392620>

created on the walls of their toilets⁹. In a follow-up phone interview with the SBM M&E expert, he stated that 60,000 to 70,000 toilets were painted in Ranchi district alone as part of this toilet painting competition (however, in the survey that was conducted, only a few such toilets were seen). He also went on to state that he had seen that in the Santhal Parganas in Jharkhand, long before the contest was held, toilets were being decorated with wall art by the Santal beneficiaries of the SBM toilet construction scheme. He mentioned that instances of toilets being painted by SBM beneficiaries on their own initiative had also been noted in Rajasthan and Gujarat (Interview with SBM M&E expert, August 2020). These two states are also famous for their own tribal wall art traditions – for example, the Mandana art of the Meena tribe of Rajasthan (Bagchi and Chaudhuri, 2015) and the Pithora paintings of the Rathwas, Bhilals, Nayaks and Tadi tribes of Gujarat (Thakur, 2016). It is interesting to note that as per reports, around 10,000 toilets have been painted in the Sohrai style during the Swachh Sundar Shauchalaya Contest¹⁰. When the SBM M&E expert was asked whether he thinks that the central level directive to conduct the Swachh Sundar Shauchalaya Contest was derived from bottom-up impulses, i.e. SBM implementers witnessing and reporting instances of rural toilets being painted and the state deciding to centralize and legitimize such initiatives, he said that he couldn't be sure. But he insisted that wall art on toilets in tribal villages in Jharkhand was evident much before the state encouraged any kind of wall art on the toilets built under the SBM. He stated that at the start of the SBM, the central government had stipulated what the toilet design should be, and had specified that the Rs. 12,000 toilet construction subsidy included the cost of whitewashing the walls of a toilet after it was constructed. However, according to him, several of the social mobilizers who were hired or appointed under the SBM in Jharkhand, had independently encouraged SBM beneficiaries to paint or otherwise decorate their toilets if they so choose (Interview with SBM M&E expert, August 2020). It may not be possible to ascertain whether traditional tribal wall art, which were more or less spontaneously displayed on the walls of SBM toilets, caught the attention of those responsible for designing SBM-related IEC activities. However, it is clear that the government is now prioritizing toilet access for tribals and the promotion of 'local art' on toilets in a combined initiative. In the central government guidelines for the building of community toilets in rural areas, states are incentivized to construct these via the promise of awards at the Panchayat, Block, District and State level. As per the guidelines, the scoring system for these awards is based on the prioritized construction of a community toilet in an area with a high SC/ST population and the number of community toilets that are beautified with local art as against the total number of community toilets built (Swachh Sundar Samudayik Shauchalaya Guidelines, 2019).

The SBM IEC expert who was responsible for SBM implementation in one half of Ranchi district, also spoke of the state's encouragement of wall art on SBM toilets as a major IEC activity:

"Another thing we do under our IEC activities...you must have seen in every village...from the government of India there came a directive to have 4+1 paintings...that

⁹<https://www.hindustantimes.com/ranchi/jharkhand-comes-first-in-cleanest-toilet-competition/story-DY3K2UuXjXZ9KUXfgzFQwK.html>

¹⁰<https://www.firstpost.com/india/in-jharkhands-hazaribagh-traditional-art-forms-wither-on-the-vine-courtesy-widespread-neglect-govt-apathy-6516491.html>

we have to paint 4 toilets and paint 1 additional banner in every village to give sanitation messages...” (Interview with SBM IEC expert, November 2019).



A mural commissioned to spread a sanitation message – linking toilets with marriageability. The Hindi text in the mural reads ‘I will marry into a house that has a toilet’. Photo Credits: Radhika Borde

Some of the toilets painted in Jharkhand’s villages are indeed the work of artists, as are the village walls displaying painted banners giving sanitation messages. However, as is evident from the toilet painting competition that was organized under the auspices of the SBM, these were not the only artists whom SBM’s implementers have encouraged. The district administration of East Singhbhum in Jharkhand has been promoting Sohrai art as a form of sanitation messaging by children. It has trained school children in this art form, via an arts-based NGO, and has organized a sanitation message painting drive, whereby the walls of all the primary, middle and high schools in the district are to be painted in the Sohrai style to convey SBM-related messages. This is in keeping with the stance of SBM implementers who insist that they see schools as agents of sanitation change and work with them to create models of sanitation behaviour which they believe would percolate throughout the immediate social environment via the students who attend these schools and carry sanitation-related messages into their homes (FGD with senior WASH trainers in Ranchi, October 2019).

However, not all tribal artists are impressed by endeavours involving the decoration of toilets with tribal art. There is criticism of the fact that the Sohrai art form is being taken away from traditional tribal artists and from the (often ritualistic) context in which it was originally created. Remuneration and recognition for the practitioners of tribal art forms in traditional contexts, i.e. on the mud walls of village houses, is dwindling. Worries are also expressed that the art form is not just being appropriated, but also altered. Where once coloured earths were used to create these paintings, each of them based on the unique vision of the female artists seeking to decorate and purify their homes in preparation for a festival, the government is now providing chemical paints to

make them and prints to copy designs from¹¹. However, in the toilets painted by SBM beneficiaries in Jharkhand, it is evident that creatively hybrid art forms are emerging – taking inspiration for example from the flower motifs that are commonly found in the tribal art forms of Jharkhand (Rani and Kumar, 2017). They use colour combinations seen in the decorative wall murals of the Santals, while simultaneously incorporating written text and the use of paints that are not traditional. This may or may not bode well for tribal art forms, and it is hard to comment on this while these impulses are still new.



A toilet painted by a beneficiary of the SBM scheme in a style that incorporates elements of traditional tribal art. Photo Credits: Radhika Borde

This paper does not explore what the consequences of the government’s current manner of engaging with tribal art forms in service of achieving sanitation goals could be. Rather it directs its discussion towards key areas vis-a-vis both sanitation and tribal art that the government could usefully focus on, without taking the position the sanitation programs and tribal art do not and should not mix.

Toilets as Symbols of Sanitation

For a toilet to be a toilet, it must be useable as such, and no number of wall paintings on it can change this. A functioning toilet with the capacity to bear the wear and tear of usage for at least a few years, is essential if toilet adoption is to be effectively encouraged and sustained. The SBM’s stated aim is the provision of toilets to every rural household in the country that lacks one. However, in interviews conducted with grassroots-level government staff it was less certain if they perceived it as so. In a focus group discussion with several Gram Rojgaar Sevaks, who are government staff involved with SBM implementation in rural areas, they stated that the toilets constructed under the SBM are not of good quality and that they are not built to last. They called them a

¹¹<https://www.firstpost.com/india/in-jharkhands-hazaribagh-traditional-art-forms-wither-on-the-vine-courtesy-widespread-neglect-govt-apathy-6516491.html>

symbol of sanitation rather than sanitation infrastructure in the true sense, and argued that they had been built to teach people about toilet usage, and create habits in relation to this. As per their opinion, once villagers got habituated to using toilets, they would rebuild the toilets constructed under the SBM and true sanitation change would take place (FGD with Gram Rojgaar Sevaks of Angara block, October 2019). Indeed, in the research conducted for this paper, it was seen that some of the toilets constructed under the SBM were not usable for the reason that the doors had come off the hinges, and in some cases the walls, roof and toilet pan were broken. The design for toilets constructed under the SBM did not include provisions for piped water, and this has been mentioned by toilet beneficiaries under the SBM scheme in rural Jharkhand as a major reason for their non-usage of these toilets, as often water needs to be carried to the household over a long distance.



Toilet constructed under the SBM in Jharkhand – already without a door
Photo Credits: Radhika Borde

One of the trainers at a WASH training centre in Ranchi stated that provision of piped water to rural toilets in Jharkhand was being implemented via a separate government scheme. However access to piped water would be preferentially given to those villages in which households had collectively demonstrated that they were using the toilets given by the SBM, regularly and over a period of time (Interview with WASH trainer in Ranchi, October 2019). Helping beneficiaries of the SBM toilet construction scheme in Jharkhand develop a feeling of ownership and pride vis-a-vis their toilets by encouraging them to paint murals onto them, may be a good initiative. But if the sanitation

infrastructure is itself inadequate, the exercise can be argued to a symbolic one rather than possessing practical significance. Furthermore, given the fact that studies have uncovered that tribals in Jharkhand express relatively less demand for sanitation infrastructure (Novotný, 2018), and that the state is aware of this, it is unlikely that the encouragement of tribal art on toilets in lieu of the provision of piped water to toilets and more durable infrastructure, would suffice to convince them. In the interviews that were part of the research conducted for this paper, a Mukhiya in Angara block mentioned that it was hard to convince tribals to participate in the SBM. A rural health worker in a Primary Health Centre in Angara block who was herself a tribal, mentioned that it was hardest to convince tribals to adopt sanitation practices, for the reason, as she understood it, that alcoholism was widely prevalent amongst tribal communities, leading as a result to the failure of sanitation education campaigns (Interviews, October 2019). Sanitation software approaches such as the encouragement of tribal art on toilets would do well to ensure that adequate sanitation infrastructure is in place at the outset and then explore, through bottom-up approaches, what members of tribal communities believe would be most convincing in terms of instigating sanitation behaviour change. In relation to the provision of inadequate infrastructure to tribals, it can be argued that similar examples have been noted of the provision of non-functioning/inadequately functioning housing infrastructure to indigenous peoples in Australia by the Australian government. In their discussion of how indigenous householders are blamed for the deterioration of their publicly funded houses due to inadequate maintenance, Tess Lea and Paul Pholeros explain how the housing that is presented for occupation to indigenous householders is not in fact housing, as it is incapable of functioning as such. They argue that housing are a foreign imposition and a cultural discontinuity and that they are more like images or representations, rather than actual houses (Lea and Pholeros, 2010).

Better cultural communication for sanitation change?

The use of images and cultural discourses to drive sanitation change is widespread in India. Religious iconography in the form of images of Hindu gods and goddesses painted onto ceramic tiles that are then embedded into walls in public spaces, is commonly seen in India. These are so placed with the view to deter urination onto these walls, and form part of a behaviour change strategy that has been described as ‘sacred nudging’ (Tagat and Kapoor, 2018). In a similar vein, one of the SBM slogans that is promoted by the Hindu Right-leaning Bharatiya Janata Party, is ‘Devalaya Se Pehle Shauchalaya’, literally a toilet before a temple (Bhowmick and Purukayastha, 2016). Art installations have been used to communicate the problem of open defecation at a global level as well – for example one that was created by a UN campaign in Zurich, Switzerland, in 2013 to mark World Toilet Day (Doron and Raja, 2015). And indeed, since research has uncovered that defecation is tied up with cultural identities (Clair et al., 2018), a cultural route to encouraging sanitation behaviour change may indeed be appropriate if it supplements an effectively implemented program aimed at sanitation infrastructure creation in the rural areas of India.

What could such a cultural route look like? For one, it is not necessarily unavoidable for government-supported initiatives involving the decoration of toilets with tribal wall art, to earn the ire of tribal artists. Translating wall art that is traditionally made on mud walls, onto the whitewashed and plastered walls of SBM-constructed toilets is less challenging a task as compared to translating it onto handmade paper and canvasses. The

latter has been successfully accomplished by an NGO that has been working with these art forms and which has stayed true to the use of naturally coloured earths to paint with and a comb with which to create patterns¹². Ideally, an intention to promote tribal art forms in tandem with the promotion of better sanitation practices should undergird a government campaign of this sort – an instrumentalization of one for the other may not be the best approach. There is currently a resurgence of Indian folk-art traditions in service of public health messaging, for example, folk and tribal art depicting mask wearing and hand washing to campaign for the measures necessary to prevent the spread of COVID-19¹³. Thus, tribal art and public health can go together – if agency and impetus remain with the artists, as seems to be the case with tribal art as it relates to the fight against COVID-19.

Furthermore, questions of tribal art aside, one must ask that if the goal is convincing villagers in Jharkhand, particularly tribals, of the importance of sanitation, why are cultural resources more directly relevant to this not being explored. Ideas related to sanitation and hygiene could be explored -from myths, folklore, and rituals of tribal groups of Jharkhand and then these could be promoted. An example in this regard would be the Santal ritual of Giddi Khachlak. When diseases begin to spread in a Santal village, the ritual of Giddi Khachlak is performed, during which the entire village is cleaned and all the garbage in it is gathered and thrown outside the village. Those performing this ritualistic act believe that it removes disease causing evil spirits from their village (Phone Interview with Santal villager, July 2020). The concepts and indeed the practical wisdom behind rituals such as these could be explored to design better targeted and more effective sanitation-related IEC activities.

Conclusion

Currently, there is increasing interest in the impact on toilet usage that the aestheticization of government-constructed toilets would have. In the state of Gujarat, a randomized trial known as the ‘5 Star Toilet Campaign’ was led by researchers from the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine. The campaign was aimed at encouraging beneficiaries of toilet construction schemes to upgrade their toilets to the level of a ‘5 Star’ toilet, and the upgrades being encouraged included the painting and decoration of toilet walls (Chauhan et al., 2019). A similarly named star rating system for tourist-oriented toilets exists in rural China (Bu, 2017). The assumption behind such interventions is that by linking ideas of quality, aesthetics, and social status, with toilet improvement, toilet usage would be encouraged. The campaign to encourage tribal art on toilets in Jharkhand can be argued to be derived from similar impulses – with an additional linkage to tribal cultural identities deriving from the encouragement of tribal art specifically. If the government is showing interest in engaging with tribal cultures of Jharkhand in order to achieve sanitation goals, perhaps the best way forward would be to deepen this engagement, and indeed to engage as much in ‘learning to learn from below’ (Kapoor, 2004), as in teaching villagers about modern forms of sanitation and hygiene management.

¹²<https://www.thehindu.com/entertainment/art/the-beauty-of-sohrai-and-khovar-paintings/article24881453.ece>

¹³<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-52464028>

Funding: This research was supported by a grant from the Czech Science Foundation [Grant number GA19-10396S]

References

- Bagchi, Tilak. and Chaudhuri, Pritish. (2015) Tribal Paintings of Rajasthan: A Micro-Study of Continuity and Change. *Man in India*. 95(3): 463-482.
- Balasubramaniam, Chitra. (2018) The beauty of Sohrai and Khovar paintings. *The Hindu*. 6 September, <https://www.thehindu.com/entertainment/art/the-beauty-of-sohrai-and-khovar-paintings/article24881453.ece> (accessed 29 July 2020).
- BBC. (2020) Gods in face masks: India's folk artists take on Covid-19. *BBC*. 2 May, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-52464028>
- Bharat, Gauri. (2015) *An Enquiry into Santal Wall Painting Practices in Singhbhum*. *Journal of Adivasi and Indigenous Studies (JAIS)*. 2(1): 35-50.
- Bhowmick, Subhendra. and Purukayastha, Anindya Sekhar. (2016) Scatologising Hindu Eschatology: An (In) Auspicious Journey from Devalaya to Shauchalaya. *History and Sociology of South Asia*. 10(2): 1-22.
- Borde, Radhika. (2019) New Roles for Indigenous Women in an Indian Eco-Religious Movement. *Religions*. 10(10): 554.
- Bu, Naipeng. (2017) Toilet Revolution as an Initiative for China's Tourism and Social Development. *Journal of China Tourism Research*. DOI: 10.1080/19388160.2017.1395776
- Chauhan, Kavita., Schmidt, Wolf. Peter., Auger, Robert., Gopalan, Balaji., Saxena, Deepak., Yashobant, S., Patwardhan, Vebhav., Bhavsar, Priya., Mavalankar, Dileep. and Curtis, Val. (2019) *The 5 Star Toilet Campaign: Improving toilet use in rural Gujarat, 3ie Grantee Final Report*. New Delhi: International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie)
- Clair, Robin. Patric., Rastogi, Rahul., Lee, Seungyoon., Clawson, Rosalee. A., III Blatchley, Ernest. R. and Erdmann, Charlotte. (2018): A Qualitative Study of Communication, Cultural Identity, and Open Defecation. *Qualitative Research Reports in Communication*. DOI: 10.1080/17459435.2018.1476906
- De, Debasree. (2018) *A History of Adivasi Women in Post-Independence Eastern India: The Margins of the Marginals*. New Delhi: Sage.
- Doron, Assa. and Raja, Ira. (2015) The cultural politics of shit: class, gender and public space in India. *Postcolonial Studies*. 18(2): 189-207.
- Gupta, Aashish., Khalid, Nazar., Hathi, Payal., Srivastav, Nikhil., Vyas, Sangita., and Coffey, Diane. (2019). Coercion, Construction, and 'ODF paper pe': Swachh Bharat According to Local Officials. Preprint - <https://osf.io/preprints/socarxiv/c3va8/>
- Hueso, Andrés. and Bell, Brian. (2013) An untold story of policy failure: the Total Sanitation Campaign in India. *Water Policy*. 15(6): 1001-1017.
- Imam, Bulu. (2011) 'Comparative traditions in village painting and prehistoric rock art of Jharkhand'. PAPERS XXIV Valcamonica Symposium, 2011.
- Juran, Luke., Adams, Ellis. A. and Prajapati, Shaifali. (2019) Purity, Pollution, and Space: Barriers to Latrine Adoption in Post-disaster India. 64: 456-469.
- Kandavel, Sangeetha. (2020) GI tag for Jharkhand's Sohrai Khovar painting, Telangana's Telia Rumal. *The Hindu*. 13 May, <https://www.thehindu.com/entertainment/art/gi-tag-for-jharkhands-sohrai-khovar-painting-telanganas-telia-rumal/article31569123.ece> (accessed 1 August 2020)
- Kapoor, Ilan. (2004) Hyper-self-reflexive development? Spivak on representing the Third World 'Other'. *Third World Quarterly*. 25(4): 627-647.

- Kislaya, Kelly. (2019) In Jharkhand's Hazaribagh, traditional art forms wither on the vine courtesy widespread neglect, govt apathy. *Firstpost*. 3 May, <https://www.firstpost.com/india/in-jharkhands-hazaribagh-traditional-art-forms-wither-on-the-vine-courtesy-widespread-neglect-govt-apathy-6516491.html> (accessed 28 July 2020).
- Kumar, Radha. (1993) *A History of Doing: An Illustrated Account of Movements for Women's Rights and Feminism in India, 1800-1990*. London: Verso.
- Lea, Tess. and Pholeros, Paul. (2010) This Is Not a Pipe: The Treacheries of Indigenous Housing. *Public Culture*. 22(1): 187-209.
- Mehta, Meera. (2018) Public finance at scale for rural sanitation – a case of Swachh Bharat Mission, India. *Journal of Water, Sanitation and Hygiene for Development*. 08(3): 359-373.
- Meskill, Lynn. (2020) Toilets first, temples second: adopting heritage in neoliberal India. *International Journal of Heritage Studies*. DOI: 10.1080/13527258.2020.1780464
- Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (2017) *Guidelines for Swachh Bharat Mission-Gramin*. Accessed from: <http://swachhbharatmission.gov.Guidelines/Complete-set-guidelines.pdf>
- Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (2019) *Swachh Sundar Samudayik Shauchalaya Guidelines*. Accessed from: https://jalshakti-ddws.gov.in//SSSS_new_guidelines.pdf
- NDTV. (2019) MyIzzatGhar: One Crore Toilets Decorated In Rural India As Part Of Swachh Sundar Shauchalaya Contest. 31 January, <https://www.ndtv.com/photos/news/myizzatghar-one-crore-toilets-decorated-in-rural-india-as-part-of-swachh-sundar-shauchalaya-contest-97062#photo-392620> (accessed 19 July 2020).
- Novotný, Josef., Ficek, František., Hill, Joseph. K. W. and Kumar, Anant. (2018) Social determinants of environmental health: A case of sanitation in rural Jharkhand. *Science of the Total Environment*. 2018. 643:762-774.
- Peal, Andy. J., Evans, Barbara. E. and Van Der Voorden, Carolien. (2010) *Hygiene and Sanitation Software: An Overview of Approaches*. Geneva: Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative Council.
- Rani, Pallavi. and Kumar, D. Udaya. (2017) 'Study of Flower Motifs in Mural Art Forms from Eastern Rural Jharkhand'. Bloomsberry Publication First International Conference on Creativity and Cognition in Art and Design, Bangalore.
- Rani, Pallavi. and Sharma, Sukanya. (2019) Inspirations of Visual Forms: A Study on Painted Mud Houses of Eastern Jharkhand. *Journal of Adivasi and Indigenous Studies (JAIS)*. 9(1): 35-55.
- Rycroft, Daniel. J. (1996) Born from the Soil: The Indigenous Mural Aesthetic of Kheroals in Jharkhand, Eastern India. *South Asian Studies*. 12(1): 67-81.
- Sarkar, Debashish. (2019) Jharkhand comes first in cleanest toilet competition. *Hindustan Times*. 26 June, <https://www.hindustantimes.com/ranchi/jharkhand-comes-first-in-cleanest-toilet-competition/story-DY3K2UuXjXZ9KUXfgzFQwK.html> (accessed 25 July 2020).
- Setty, Karen., Loret, Jean-Francois., Courtois, Sopia., Hammer, Charlotte. Christiane., Hartemann, Philippe., Lafforgue, Michel., Litrico, Xavier., Manasfi, Tarek., Medema, Gertjan., Shaheen, Mohamed., Tesson, Vincent. and Bartram, Jamie. (2019). Faster and safer: Research priorities in water and health. *International journal of hygiene and environmental health*. 222(4): 593-606.
- Sharma, Aman. (2017) Call Swachh Bharat toilets 'Izzat Ghar': Centre to states. *The Economic Times*. 17 October, https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/call-swachh-bharat-toilets-izzat-ghar-centre-to-states/articleshow/61123473.cms?utm_source=contentofinterest&utm_medium=text&utm_campaign=cppst (accessed 20 July 2020).

Swachh Bharat (Gramin). (2019) Over 54,000 toilets painted in Ranchi. 30 January, <https://sbmgramin.wordpress.com/2019/01/30/over-54000-toilets-painted-in-ranchi/> (accessed 17 July 2020).

Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin). <https://sbm.gov.in/sbmdashboard/IHHL.aspx> (accessed 19 July 2020).

Tagat, Anirudh. and Kapoor, Hansika. (2018) “Sacred nudging” and sanitation decisions in India. *India Review*. 17(3): 301-319.

Thakur, Shanti. Kumari. (2016) Pithora: A View on Traditional Art & Culture of Gujarat. *International Journal of Recent Advances in Multidisciplinary Research*. 3(3): 1318-1320.

Verma, Rashmi. (2019) Only 71.3% rural households have access to toilets, shows NSSO data. *Down To Earth*. 25 November, <https://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/rural-water-and-sanitation/only-71-3-rural-households-have-access-to-toilets-shows-nssso-data-67929#:~:text=The%20new%20data%20shows%20that,rural%20areas%20regularly%20use%20toilets> (accessed 22 July 2020).

Vyas, Sangita. and Spears, Dean. (2018) Sanitation and Religion in South Asia: What Accounts for Differences across Countries? *The Journal of Development Studies*. 54(11): 2119-2135.